

Flatbread Earth

Lexie Smith

I look at evidence of place and feel like I come from nowhere. My nowhere is an American suburb, and going somewhere doesn't change my nowhere, because where I go is not where I come from. So I bake bread after bread. The flatter it is, the more it transports me. I used to bake breads that came from somewhere else, but now I make breads without history, born from intuition and whim, because they're evidence of my immediate circumstance. This is what bread has always been, everywhere: a direct product of our lives, proof we exist, even if we come from nowhere.

It's easy to overlook bread's potential as a canary in the coal mine, or as a sponge, or better yet, as a spore — an atom that breaks off from the mass and carries it elsewhere. Tiny, fractal, and totally necessary for survival. I can make up a long story about a place knowing only how someone bakes their bread there. Many of the most evocative breads are flat, round or rectangular, and inconsequential looking. I like them the best, above and beyond the elaborately piled and lofted ones of the global North, where wheat with plenty of the necessary proteins for a high-rising loaf grows well in the temperate climates. The affection for these European style breads has been exported and profited from for a long time. Bread follows money, silently, unless there is neither left. Then things get louder.

Bread is practically indefinable, but different loaves do come from somewhere in particular piadina from Romagna, Italy, nan-e barbari from Iran, cozonac from Romania, neighbor to its Ashkenazi Jewish cousin babka. Still, since it first rose, bread has been framed as a gift from the heavens, a kind of divine presentation ("Take this, it is my body", said Jesus Christ himself, offering the sacramental bread in an outstretched hand to his disciples). But there's more evidence of humans than of holiness in the story of bread. It took intuition, innovation, coercion and labor to turn wheat into flour, and dough into a leavened, digestible staple, and later a processed, malnourishing one, too. From the domestication of grain, to the harnessing of fermentation, the development of milling and sifting systems, the mastery of ovens, and later the global distribution of patented wheat seeds and subsidized white bread, we have a story evidential of the spectrum of human potential, Ingenuity, opportunity, imagination, expansion, accumulation, consolidation, manipulation, extraction, and destruction.

If one wants to change the narrative of a place, particularly to take it and make it theirs, they're wise to import their own daily bread and make it cheap and plentiful. Early colonizers took flour with them and generally made bread in their image where they went (white, inflated). American suburbs like my own have domestically grown wheat because the European settlers brought the grain with them and planted it upon arrival. Takes on the baguette are found throughout Africa and South Asia, evidence of the French imperial tour, and the flour tortilla of Mexico is a product of a similar colonial enterprise undertaken there by the Spanish. More recently, the hybrid wheat that replaced regional varieties throughout India in the 1960s and '70s was developed by an Iowa-born Rockefeller grantee who later won the Nobel Peace Prize. And from day one, colonists and early statesmen used religion and bread (its staff), to encourage their subjects towards 'civility'. See Enkidu, the barbarian of Gilgamesh (the earliest of epics, which came out of Uruk, the world's first city-state), who was civilized by bread and wine and sex (notably all products of some kind of ferment, or foment) and turned into a worthy citizen of an urban sphere, a taxpayer.

The utility of bread, be it spiritual, bodily, economic, or otherwise, is literally a tale as old as time. Flatbreads were there at the start, and remain the staple of much of the bread-eating world. They've survived because they embody that utility: they're versatile, variable and convenient. I spend a lot of time searching through virtual rubble for them from over here in my nowhere, west of somewhere. I can't always keep straight the names of the hundreds of different types I've recorded over the years, unless I've tasted them (most, I haven't). Lahoh, rugag, bammy, mana'eesh, baghrir, samoon, chumuth, lefse, doday, sheermal, aish, bazlama, poee, koulibij naan...

22

A01 Sushka

A02 Baranka

A03 Bublik

A04 Covrigi

A05 Ka'ak

A06 Matnakash

A07 Sheermal A08 Ksra

A09 Matlouh A10 Harcha

B01 Bammy

B02 Medfouna

B03 Mbesses

B04 Gozleme

B05 Sabayad B06 Mahiouba

B07 Katma

B08 Qutab

B09 Rougag

B10 Katlama

C01 Paratha C02 Pone

C03 Bannock

C04 Flatkaka C05 Taboon

C06 Aish Balady

C07 Poee C08 Bazlama

C09 Sfenz

C10 Mekitsa

D01 Sopapilla

D02 Fry Bread

D03 Bishi D04 Nan-e Barbari

D05 Sangak

D06 Samoon

D07 Shotis Puri

D08 Khambir

D09 Bing Zi

D10 Qatlama

F01 Tahinov Hatz

E02 Simit

E03 Shao Bing E04 Mankoush

F05 Mana'eesh

E06 Lahmajun

F07 Goraasa F08 Taftan

E09 Batbout

E10 Khoubz

F01 Chapati

F02 Yufka

F03 Casabe

F04 Kisra F05 Baghrir

F06 Crumpets F07 Lahoh

F08 Iniera

F09 Hopper F10 Noni Toki

G01 Matzah

G02 Chumuth

G03 Rumali Roti

G04 Sobaguera G05 Doday

G06 Lavash

G07 Ngome

G08 Lefse

G09 Blini

G10 Rougag

H01 Sultsinat

H03 Tortillas de Maíz

H04 Rogag

H05 Pane Carasau H06 Laufabrauð

H07 Obi Non

H08 Himbasha

H09 Kesra

H10 Libba

I find flatbreads the most representative of their place because their form aligns them all, creating subtle contrast through comparison. Piki, a flatbread of the Hopi Nation, is a papery roll made of finely ground local blue corn flour cooked on a griddle set over a fire; injera is a more pliable and spongey flatbread from Ethiopia, made from a batter of fermented ground teff, which grows well there; kisra, a sorghum pancake from Sudan, Chad and South Sudan, is formally somewhere between the two: rieska from Finland is made with the barley or rye that grows in the harsher cold climates of the North; and the barley, turtle bean and ground pea porridge bread paba that's found in Ladakh, where the high altitudes deter many other grains from growing, might scarcely be recognized elsewhere as bread at all.

Despite their variation, their forms really have just a few distinguishing characteristics: leavened or unleavened, cooked or baked, thin or thick. So it's the nuances that scaffold their meaning: who builds the ovens or fires the griddle? Are the breads made at home or in the market? What access do the bakers have to fuel and how often? How is the process of baking passed between them? What grain raises the bread how high, and with what method of leavening? Who can afford to buy it? To make it? What happens when they can't?

I collected these pictures and put them next to each other to see how similar a dissimilarity can appear. The breads flow one to the next, barely distinguishable from each other. Each has a name, a place, and a chain of people and plants that make it what it is, and unlike the others. Sometimes it's hard to spot the difference just by looking at them.

23